

**IEEE SA Standards Board Audit Committee (AudCom)**

**Meeting Minutes**

21 and 22 January 2021

9:00 a.m. - 11:00 a.m. ET (UTC-5) on both dates

Teleconference

**Members:**

Peter Balma  
Doug Edwards  
Ramy A. Fathy  
Thomas Koshy  
John Kulick, Chair  
Joseph Levy  
Howard Li  
Kevin Lu  
Daleep Mohla  
Mehmet Ulema  
Philip Winston  
Daidi Zhong  
Jingyi Zhou

**Guests:**

Edward Addy  
Travis Griffith  
Gary Hoffman  
Xiaohui Liu  
Haiying Lu  
Jon Rosdahl  
Mark Siira  
Dorothy Stanley  
Claire Topp [Legal counsel]  
Lei Wang  
Keith Waters [Part time]  
Karl Weber  
Howard Wolfman  
Don Wright

**IEEE Staff:**

Matt Ceglia  
Karen Evangelista  
Jonathan Goldberg  
Jodi Haasz [Session 1]  
Yvette Ho Sang  
Konstantinos Karachalios

Soo Kim  
Michael Kipness  
Vanessa Lalitte  
Kelly Lorne  
Greg Marchini [Part time]  
Erin Morales  
Ashley Moran  
Christian Orlando  
Dave Ringle  
Pat Roder  
Jennifer Santulli  
Tom Thompson  
Lisa Weisser, Administrator  
Malia Zaman  
Meng Zhao

**[Unless otherwise noted, all votes are unanimous]**

## **1. CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS**

Chair Kulick called the meeting to order at 9:02 a.m. ET (UTC-5). He welcomed everyone to the final meeting of the 2020 AudCom and welcomed the incoming 2021 AudCom members. There was a round of introductions.

## **2. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA**

Chair Kulick explained that in order to have enough time during the meeting to cover some remaining items from old business that AudCom Session 1 will start with items 5.4 and 5.5 on the agenda. He asked if there were any additions, deletions, or additional alterations to the published agenda. There were none.

**A motion was made (Winston) and seconded (Mohla) to approve the 21 and 22 January 2021 AudCom meeting agenda. In the absence of objection, the motion was approved.**

## **3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF THE 06 NOVEMBER 2020 P&P REVIEW MEETING AND 01 DECEMBER 2020 AUDCOM MEETING**

**A motion was made (Koshy) and seconded (Mohla) to approve the minutes of the 06 November 2020 P&P Review meeting and the 01 December 2020 AudCom meeting. In the absence of objection, the motion was approved.**

AudCom discussed agenda items 5.4 and 5.5 next.

## **4. P&P REVIEW**

### **4.1 Status of Continuing Standards Committee P&P Review**

4.1.1 APS/SC - Howard Li, Daleep Mohla

There are still open comments from the checklist that have not been addressed and the P&P will continue under review and move to the March 2021 AudCom agenda.

During the discussion of this P&P review, the issue was raised about external documents, such as a Society's bylaws being included in the P&Ps. This issue has come up in several other reviews, and it was clarified that external documents shall not be referenced in any of a Standards Committee's P&Ps.

#### 4.1.2 C/LM - Phil Winston, Jingyi Zhou

The reviewers explained that the P&P document would be recommended for acceptance, but the final version that is in myProject has not been approved by the 802 Executive Committee, so the recommendation is for conditional acceptance, with the condition that the 802 Executive Committee approves the document. There was additional clarification that if the document is not approved by the 802 Executive Committee, the condition will not be met and the recommendation would no longer be valid.

**Motion: To recommend conditional acceptance of the C/LM P&P; contingent upon the 802 Executive Committee approving the current revised version in myProject. Upon vote, the motion passed.**

***NB: This condition has been met.***

#### 4.1.3 C/PA - Doug Edwards, Daidi Zhong

There are still open comments from the checklist that have not been addressed and the P&P will continue under review and move to the March 2021 AudCom agenda.

#### 4.1.4 C/SI - Kevin Lu, Thomas Koshy

There are still open comments from the checklist that have not been addressed and the P&P will continue under review and move to the March 2021 AudCom agenda.

#### 4.1.5 IM/ST - Ramy Fathy, Joseph Levy

There are still open comments from the checklist that have not been addressed and the P&P will continue under review and move to the March 2021 AudCom agenda.

#### 4.1.6 SEN/SC - Daleep Mohla, Doug Edwards

There are still open comments from the checklist that have not been addressed and the P&P will continue under review and move to the March 2021 AudCom agenda.

#### 4.1.7 VT/CBTC&SIG - Doug Edwards, Joseph Levy

**Motion: To recommend acceptance of the VT/CBTC&SIG P&P. Upon vote, the motion passed.**

Following the outcome of this review, AudCom discussed item 6.1.2 on the agenda.

#### 4.1.8 VT/TPSSC - Jingyi Zhou, Peter Balma

**Motion: To recommend acceptance of the VT/TPSSC P&P. Upon vote, the motion passed.**

Following the outcome of this review, AudCom discussed item 6.1.3 on the agenda.

#### **4.2 Status of New Standards Committee P&P Review**

##### 4.2.1 IM/RNIS - Howard Li, Phil Winston

There are still open comments from the checklist that have not been addressed and the P&P will continue under review and move to the March 2021 AudCom agenda.

AudCom went into recess at 10:58 a.m. ET (UTC-5) on 21 January. Gary Hoffman thanked the 2020 AudCom Members and welcomed new and continuing 2021 AudCom Members.

The AudCom meeting reconvened at 9:02 a.m. ET (UTC-5) on 22 January.

#### **4.3 Status of Continuing Working Group P&P Review**

##### 4.3.1 C/BDL (Common - all C/BDL Individual WGs) - Doug Edwards, Daidi Zhong

There are still open comments from the checklist that have not been addressed and the P&P will continue under review and move to the March 2021 AudCom agenda.

##### 4.3.2 C/SM (Common - all C/SM Entity WGs) - Phil Winston, Ramy Fathy

**Motion: To deem without issue the C/SM (Common - all C/SM Entity WGs) Working Group P&P. Upon vote, the motion passed.**

##### 4.3.3 IAS/IPCS (Common - all IAS/IPCS Individual WGs) - Howard Li, Mehmet Ulema

**Motion: To deem without issue the IAS/IPCS (Common - all IAS/IPCS Individual WGs) Working Group P&P. Upon vote, the motion passed (11 approve, 0 disapprove, 1 abstain [Winston]).**

##### 4.3.4 MTT/SCC/MSMU\_WG - Phil Winston, Jingyi Zhou

**Motion: To deem without issue the MTT/SCC/MSMU\_WG Working Group P&P. Upon vote, the motion passed.**

##### 4.3.5 PE/IC (Common - all PE/IC Individual WGs) - Mehmet Ulema, Joseph Levy

**Motion: To deem without issue the PE/IC (Common - all PE/IC Individual WGs) Working Group P&P. Upon vote, the motion passed.**

##### 4.3.6 SASB/SCC20 (Common - all SASB/SCC20 Individual WGs) - Joseph Levy, Howard Li

There are still open comments from the checklist that have not been addressed and the P&P will continue under review and move to the March 2021 AudCom agenda.

4.3.7 SASB/SCC21 (Common - all SASB/SCC21 Individual WGs) - Philip Winston, Peter Balma

**To conditionally deem without issue the SASB/SCC21 (Common - all SASB/SCC21 Individual WGs) Working Group P&P; contingent upon making the title language consistent in three locations in the document. Upon vote, the motion passed.**

#### **4.4 Status of New Working Group P&P Review**

There were no new Working Group P&Ps.

### **5. OLD BUSINESS**

#### **5.1 Action Item Review - Lisa Weisser**

Lisa Weisser noted that all action items from meetings that took place in 2020 were complete. The one remaining item is to determine whether there is a need to add information to the AudCom Conventions about terminology definition within P&P documents, and this will be a topic to discuss for the upcoming AudCom FAQs.

#### **5.2 Update on P&Ps Due in 2021**

Lisa Weisser noted that there are 16 Standards Committees with P&Ps expiring at the end of 2021. With recent Standards Committee P&Ps accepted in 2020 and now this meeting, the list of Working Group P&Ps requested for review by AudCom is increasing, and staff will work with the Standards Committees to help them submit WG P&Ps for AudCom review.

#### **5.3 Discussion - AudCom Baseline Checklists and Instructions**

Chair Kulick thanked and acknowledged the tremendous amount of work by the volunteers who worked on the baselines review checklists and instructions documents, specifically Peter Balma, Doug Edwards, Joseph Levy, and Phil Winston, as well as Lisa Weisser.

Doug Edwards described the updates to the checklists and there was a recommendation to approve the documents.

**Motion: Approve the use of the updated checklists, with minor edits identified in later discussions, to be used with the 2020 baseline documents. Upon vote, the motion passed.**

Joseph Levy and Peter Balma described the process of updating the separate instructions documents that accompany each baseline document. Instead of using the previous documents and only updating sections as needed, there is a new flow of the content, with additional explanations and references provided. Following the discussion, a recommendation was made.

**Motion: Approve the use of the updated instructions, with minor edits identified in later discussions, to be used with the 2020 baseline documents. Upon vote, the motion passed.**

Additionally, Lisa Weisser explained that some corrections need to be made to some of the approved red instructional text in the baseline documents. She presented the list of text updates, and following a discussion which included additional edits to some of the updates, a motion was made to approve the edits.

**Motion: Approve the updates to the red instructional text in the 2020 baseline documents. Upon vote, the motion passed.**

#### **5.4 Ad Hoc Update - Working Group P&Ps - Daleep Mohla**

Daleep Mohla provided an update of the previously distributed ad hoc report, which was briefly discussed at the September 2020 AudCom meeting. It was agreed that there is currently no need to add information to the AudCom Conventions because the updated baselines make it more clear which P&Ps need to be used for a newly formed Working Group. There is also now a plan to develop FAQs for the AudCom website with necessary information for AudCom best practices for what P&Ps should be used by a newly formed Working Group and when such a Working Group can submit a PAR to NesCom. Any suggestions for FAQs to be addressed should be sent to Lisa Weisser or the AudCom Chair.

Chair Kulick disbanded the ad hoc with thanks.

#### **5.5 Discussion on Additions to AudCom Conventions**

##### **5.5.1 Submittal Deadlines - Doug Edwards**

Doug Edwards presented an update on the recommendation for potential updates to the AudCom Conventions that was briefly discussed during the September 2020 meeting. There was discussion on the topic of whether or not there should be submittal deadlines for new and revised P&Ps before each AudCom meeting. It was agreed that while the Conventions are not requirements, the text in the recommendation presented needs to be edited to clarify that these are timing guidelines. The recommendation included a motion to incorporate text into the AudCom Conventions about these guidelines, and updated text that would clarify what is considered an editorial correction for the P&Ps. The motion presented was deferred until AudCom Session 2, and Lisa Weisser was asked to send the updated version of the document that was discussed during Session 1.

**AI: Lisa Weisser to send the updated presentation to AudCom for continued discussion during Session 2 of the AudCom meeting.**

***NB: This item is complete.***

During AudCom Session 2, Chair Kulick, with agreement from incoming Chair Lu, formed the Ad hoc on Improved Opportunities for AudCom Member Review of Materials with the following scope:

The ad hoc shall consider various means to improve the opportunity for all AudCom Members to be able to review necessary materials (e.g., checklists, updated P&P submittals, etc.) in advance of a regularly scheduled AudCom meeting.

The ad hoc, Chaired by Kevin Lu, includes the following members: Peter Balma, Doug Edwards, Ramy Fathy, Jonathan Goldberg, Michael Kipness, Joseph Levy, Haiying Lu, Daleep Mohla, Erin Morales, Dave Ringle, Keith Waters, Lisa Weisser, and Philip Winston.

#### 5.5.2 Terminology Definition in Higher Level Standards Committee Documents

Lisa Weisser explained this topic that carried over from 2020. The question had been raised about whether or not there is a need to add information to the AudCom Conventions about terminology definition within P&P documents. For example, if a term mentioned in a Working Group P&P is defined in the Standards Committee P&P, there is no need to define it in the Working Group P&P, but the Standards Committee needs to acknowledge that in response to the review checklist. This topic will be added to the list of potential questions for the AudCom FAQs.

Following this agenda item, the meeting continued to the P&P reviews in agenda item 4.

#### 5.6 Committee member interactions/comments RE: myProject

This item was not discussed during the meeting due to lack of time.

***NB: This is a standing agenda item and if anyone has any feedback about their user experience with myProject, please let Lisa Weisser know.***

### 6. NEW BUSINESS

#### 6.1 Request for Standards Committee Recognition

##### 6.1.1 IEEE Instrumentation and Measurement Society/TC45 - Radiation and Nuclear Instrumentation and Systems (IM/RNIS)

The Standards Committee P&Ps are continuing under review and this recognition request will move to the March 2021 AudCom meeting.

##### 6.1.2 IEEE Vehicular Technology Society/Communications Based Train Control and Signals (VT/CBTC&SIG)

This was discussed after agenda item 4.1.7.

**Motion: Recommend that the SASB recognize the Vehicular Technology Society/Communications Based Train Control and Signals, to be abbreviated as (VT/CBTC&SIG), as an official Standards Committee, in accordance with IEEE SASB Bylaws 5.2.2. Upon vote, the motion passed.**

##### 6.1.3 IEEE Vehicular Technology Society/Traction Power Systems Standards Committee (VT/TPSSC)

This was discussed after agenda item 4.1.8.

**Motion: Recommend that the SASB recognize the Vehicular Technology Society/Traction Power Systems Standards Committee, to be abbreviated as (VT/TPSSC), as an official Standards Committee, in accordance with IEEE SASB Bylaws 5.2.2. Upon vote, the motion passed.**

## **6.2 myProject Update**

Due to lack of time, this agenda item was deferred again, with Chair Kulick's apology, to the March 2021 AudCom meeting.

## **7. DATE OF NEXT MEETING**

The next meeting of AudCom will take place on 22 and 23 March 2021 by teleconference.

## **8. ADJOURNMENT**

Chair Kulick acknowledged Peter Balma for all of the work he did with the baselines updates and the instructions. Chair Kulick and Lisa Weisser thanked the 2020 AudCom members, and Daleep Mohla thanked Chair Kulick and Lisa Weisser. There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 11:02 a.m. ET (UTC-5).